



MOBILE APP MAPPING FOR HEART FAILURE CARE: A SCOPING REVIEW

Virna Ribeiro Feitosa Cestari¹ Raquel Sampaio Florêncio¹ Thiago Santos Garces¹ Lorena Campos de Souza¹ Vera Lúcia Mendes de Paula Pessoa¹ Thereza Maria Magalhães Moreira¹

¹Universidade Estadual do Ceará, Programa de Pós-Graduação Cuidados Clínicos em Enfermagem e Saúde. Fortaleza, Ceará, Brasil.

ABSTRACT

Objective: to map mobile apps for care in heart failure.

Method: this is a scoping review based on the method proposed by the Joanna Briggs Institute. The following research question was used: which mobile apps on heart failure are used by health professionals, people with heart failure and their family/caregivers? Health bases and portals were analyzed through the search with the descriptors "Heart Failure", "Mobile Applications", "Patients", "Health Personnel", "Family" and "Caregivers" and the keyword "Applications". Forty-seven studies were selected for analysis.

Results: a total of 47 published studies were analyzed, which allowed mapping 39 mobile applications from four continents, among which 20 (51.3%) were intended for co-management and 19 (48.7%) had as target population patients and health professionals; 23 (58.9%) applications did not use theoretical framework for its construction. The prevalent theme and resources involved daily care (36; 92.3%) and data management (37; 94.9%), respectively.

Conclusion: the themes and resources of the applications assisted patients, family members and professionals in heart failure management. However, a gap was identified in several themes involving individuals and their surroundings, essential for comprehensive care.

DESCRIPTORS: Heart failure. Technology. Telemedicine. Mobile applications. Health promotion. Nursing.

HOW CITED: CESTARI VRF, FLORÊNCIO RS, GARCES TS, SOUZA LC, PESSOA VLMP, MOREIRA TMM. Mobile app mapping for heart failure care: a scoping review. Texto Contexto Enferm [Internet]. 2022 [cited YEAR MONTH DAY]; 31:e20210211; Available from: https://doi.org/10.1590/1980-265X-TCE-2021-0211.



1/16

MAPEAMENTO DOS APLICATIVOS MÓVEIS PARA O CUIDADO NA INSUFICIÊNCIA CARDÍACA: REVISÃO DE ESCOPO

RESUMO

Objetivo: mapear os aplicativos móveis para o cuidado na insuficiência cardíaca.

Método: revisão de escopo baseada no método proposto pelo Instituto Joanna Briggs. Com a seguinte questão de pesquisa: quais os aplicativos móveis sobre insuficiência cardíaca são utilizados por profissionais da saúde, pessoas com insuficiência cardíaca e seus familiares/cuidadores? Foram analisados bases e portais de saúde captados via busca com os descritores "Insuficiência cardíaca", "Aplicativos móveis", "Pacientes", "Pessoal de saúde", "Família" e "Cuidadores" e a palavra-chave "Aplicativos". Foram selecionados 47 estudos para análise.

Resultados: foram analisados 47 estudos publicados, que permitiu mapear 39 aplicativos móveis, oriundos de quatro continentes, dentre os quais 20 (51,3%) tinham como finalidade o cogerenciamento e 19 (48,7%) tinham como população-alvo pacientes e profissionais da saúde; 23 (58,9%) aplicativos não utilizaram referencial teórico para sua construção. A temática e os recursos prevalentes envolveram cuidados diários (36;92,3%) e gerenciamento dos dados (37;94,9%), respectivamente.

Conclusão: as temáticas e recursos dos aplicativos auxiliaram pacientes, familiares e profissionais na gestão da insuficiência cardíaca. Contudo, identificou-se hiato em diversas temáticas que envolvem o indivíduo e seu entorno, imprescindíveis para o cuidado integral.

DESCRITORES: Insuficiência cardíaca. Tecnologia. Telemedicina. Aplicativos móveis. Promoção da saúde. Enfermagem.

MAPEO DE APLICACIONES MÓVILES PARA LA ATENCIÓN DE LA INSUFICIENCIA CARDÍACA: REVISIÓN DEL ALCANCE

RESUMEN

Objetivo: mapear aplicaciones móviles para el cuidado de la insuficiencia cardíaca.

Método: revisión del alcance basado en el método propuesto por el Instituto Joanna Briggs. Con la siguiente pregunta de investigación: ¿qué aplicaciones móviles de insuficiencia cardíaca utilizan los profesionales sanitarios, las personas con insuficiencia cardíaca y sus familiares/cuidadores? Se analizaron bases de datos y portales de salud capturados mediante búsqueda con los descriptores "Insuficiencia cardíaca", "Aplicaciones Móviles", "Pacientes", "Personal de Salud", "Familia" y "Cuidadores" y la palabra clave "Aplicaciones". Se seleccionaron 47 estudios para su análisis.

Resultados: se analizaron 47 estudios publicados, que permitieron mapear 39 aplicaciones móviles, de cuatro continentes, de las cuales 20 (51,3%) tenían la finalidad de cogestión y 19 (48,7%) tenían como población objetivo pacientes y profesionales de la salud; 23 (58,9%) aplicaciones no utilizaron un marco teórico para su construcción. El tema y los recursos prevalentes fueron el cuidado diario (36;92,3%) y la gestión de datos (37;94,9%), respectivamente.

Conclusión: los temas y características de las aplicaciones ayudaron a pacientes, familias y profesionales en el manejo de la insuficiencia cardíaca. Sin embargo, se identificó una brecha en varios temas que involucran al individuo y su entorno, los cuales son fundamentales para la atención integral.

DESCRIPTORES: Insuficiencia cardíaca. Tecnología. Telemedicina. Aplicaciones móviles. Promoción de la salud. Enfermería.



INTRODUCTION

Heart failure (HF) is an emerging global threat, with a worldwide prevalence of 64.34 million cases (8.52 per 1,000 inhabitants), representing 9.91 million years lost due to disability and spending of US\$346.17 billion,1 with perspective of increase, despite the therapeutic advance. HF puts patients at high risk of sudden death or progressive organ failure, besides causes physical, clinical, social and psychological disorders. Thus, improving care and prognosis of these patients is an essential goal of public health.

In this sense, health care should extrapolate the restoration of clinical parameters. It demands conditions for health promotion, protection and recovery, because it involves factors such as food, work, income, access to goods, services and information^{2–4}, which requires professionals, patients and caregivers/family members adaptability and skills to reinvent care, due to the chronic character of HF, which has symptoms and treatments for prolonged periods. From this perspective, adopting digital and mobile health technologies, such as applications (APPs), is an alternative for expanding care, without disregarding the subjects to whom care actions are intended, in addition to practicality and the ability to interact⁵.

In HF, APPs can encourage the adoption of healthy behaviors, allow monitoring of patients, increase knowledge of the disease and also help professionals in clinical decision-making⁶, as they enable access to information and applications anywhere and anytime. However, the indication and insertion of this technology in professionals' care routine, patients with HF and their families to meet demands that result in effective gains, must be assessed.

Therefore, it is justified to map APPs that have already been developed to assess their quality and their actual use in the routine care of patients with HF. However, it appears that themes already addressed in the literature are reduced and fragmented in the context of self-care and management, and exclude professionals and family members/caregivers^{5–6}. In this area, this study is relevant because it fills a literary gap about APPs on HF, highlighting the need to expand existing knowledge, in order to know the contents and resources presented.

Thus, this research aimed to map mobile applications for care in HF.

METHOD

This is a scoping review, whose construction followed the Joanne Briggs Institute (JBI)⁷ guidelines and the Preferred Reporting Items checklist for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses - Extension for Scoping Review (PRISMA-ScR) recommendations⁸. As this is a review study, approval by an Institutional Review Board is not required.

The research question was constituted as: which mobile applications about hf are used by health professionals, People with HF and their family members/caregivers? Eligibility criteria were defined using the acronym PCC (Population, Concept and Context). For the population, health professionals, people with HF and their family members/caregivers were chosen; for the concept, studies on development, usability, feasibility and validation of APPs on HF were selected; and, as a context, HF was used. Articles electronically published in full, with no restriction on language or year of publication were types of evidence sources.

For this, studies were searched on the Latin American and Caribbean Literature on Health Sciences (LILACS), Spanish Bibliographic Index of Health Sciences (IBECS) ScienceDirect, Web of Science, Scopus, Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL), EBSCO, Embase, PsycInfo and PubMed portal databases.

The searches and study selection process took place from December 2019 to August 2020. The descriptors were used according to the terminology of the Health Science Descriptors (DeCS)



and Medical Subject Headings (MeSH): "Heart Failure", "Mobile Apps", "Patients", "Health Personnel", "Family" and "Caregivers". It is reiterated that the keyword "Applications" was included in the searches, in order to expand the findings. Searches were performed with these terms, integrating them using the Boolean operators "AND" and "OR".

We chose to carry out the search with descriptors in the English language, as the equation enabled the identification of a greater number of articles, when compared to searches with descriptors in Portuguese and Spanish. On LILACS and IBECS, the strategy was set up (tw:(*insuficiência cardíaca*)) AND (tw:(*aplicativos móveis*)) OR (tw:(*aplicativos*)) AND (tw:(*pessoal da saúde*)) OR (tw:(*paciente*)) OR (tw:(*familia*)) OR (tw:(*cuidadores*)); on the PubMed portal, ((((((heart failure) and mobile applications) or applications) and pacients) or health personnel) or family) or caregivers; on Web of Science and ScienceDirect, the equation was used (heart failure) AND (mobile applications or "applications") AND (patients) OR (health personnel) OR (family) OR (caregivers) AND TÓPICO: ("heart failure"); on Scopus, (TITLE-ABS-KEY (heart failure) AND TITLE-ABS-KEY (mobile applications or "applications") AND TITLE-ABS-KEY (patients) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY (health personnel) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY (family) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY (caregivers); on EBSCO, CINAHL and Embase, (heart failure) AND (mobile applications or "applications or "applications") AND (patients) OR theart failure AND Any Field: mobile applications OR Any Field: "applications or "applications or "applications") AND TITLE-ABS-KEY (caregivers); on EBSCO, CINAHL and Embase, (heart failure) AND (mobile applications or "applications") AND (patients") OR (patients) OR (health personnel) OR (family) OR (caregivers); e, por fim, na PsycInfo, Title: heart failure AND Any Field: mobile applications OR Any Field: "applications" AND Any Field: "health personnel" OR Any Field: "family" OR Any Field: "family" OR Any Field: "health caregivers".

Furthermore, the studies were selected by two independent reviewers. Disputes were resolved with critical discussion among reviewers. If they were unable to reach a consensus, a third reviewer would assist in the process. Furthermore, data collection was carried out in September 2020 and they were organized in a spreadsheet in Microsoft Excel[®]. Each study was coded with the letter "A", followed by a number.

For data extraction, the JBI⁷ instrument was adapted, considering the following aspects: identification (title, authors, language, country, place, journal, year of publication and APP name); methodological aspects (objectives, research design, framework, sampling, data processing); and critical analysis (themes covered, resources, strengths and weaknesses and main conclusions).

Finally, the presentation of the obtained data was given in a table, with a synthesis of the studies and figures to map the information related to the country of development of the researches and contents and resources identified in the APPs.

RESULTS

The search identified 747 potentially relevant studies, of which 409 were removed for duplication. The remaining 338 studies were selected by title and abstract. Of this total, 132 studies were included for full-text analysis by two independent reviewers. Then, after reading in full, another 85 studies were excluded for not answering the research question, leaving 47 studies (Figure 1).

Therefore, data pertinent to the acronym that founded the research question and the purpose of this review were extracted from primary studies, such as authors, application name, purpose, method and target population, which are characterized below in Chart 1.





Figure 1 - Diagram of the study selection process according to PRISMAScR guidelines. Fortaleza, CE, Brazil, 2021.

Authors	Application name	Purpose	Method	Target population
Du et al. ⁹	NI*	Knowledge and Self-care	Development, feasibility and aceitabilidade	People with HF [†] Family members/ caregivers
Wonggom et al. ¹⁰	NI*	Self-care	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Kiyarosta et al. ¹¹	My Smart Heart	Self-care	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Heiney et al. ¹²	Healthy Heart	Self-monitoring	Feasibility and usability	People with HF [†]
Cornet et al. ¹³	Power of the Pacient	Knowledge	Feasibility and usability	Health professionals
Yanicelli et al.14	SiTe iC	Co-management	Development	People with HF [†]
Yanicelli et al.15	SiTe iC	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
DeVore et al. ¹⁶	CONNECT-HF (HealthStar)	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Woods et al. ¹⁷	Care4MyHeart	Co-management	Development	People with HF [†] Family members/ caregivers Health professionals

Chart 1 - Characterization of articles selected for scoping review. Fortaleza, CE, Brazil, 2021.



Authors	Application name	Purpose	Method	Target population
Ware et al. ¹⁸	Medley	Self-monitoring Clinical validation		People with HF [†]
Werhahn et al. ¹⁹	CPMP	Co-management	Feasibility	People with HF [†]
Sharma et al.20	TARGET-HF-DM	Self-care	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Arulnathan, Vaaheesan and Denecke ²¹	Eletronic Heart Diary	Co-management and motivation	Development	People with HF [†]
Windmon et al.22	TussisWatch	Diagnosis	Development	People with HF [†]
Woods et al. ²³	Care4MyHeart	Self-management	Usability	People with HF [†] Family members/ caregivers Health professionals
Baik et al. ²⁴	mi.Symptoms	Self-care	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Kongsofla et al. ²⁵	MySmartHeart	Self-care and knowledge	Internal validation	People with HF [†] Family members/ caregivers Health professionals
Lloyd et al. ²⁶	Penn State Heart Assistant	Self-care	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Zhang, Babu and Gimbel ²⁷	iHeartU	Self-care	Usability	People with HF [†] Health professionals
Scherr et al.28	MOBITEL	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Athilingam et al. ²⁹	CHF Info App	Knowledge	Adequacy and readability	People with HF [†]
Guo et al. ³⁰	NI*	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF^{\dagger}
Haynes and Kim ³¹	OnPoint	Self-management	Adequacy	People with HF [†] Profissionais
Portz et al. ³²	HF App	Self-care	Internal validation	People with HF [†]
Foster ³³	HF App	Self-care	Development	People with HF [†]
Spanakis, Psaraki and Sakkalis ³⁴	NI*	Co-management	Development and usability	People with HF [†]
Baert et al.35	HeartMan	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Athilingam, Clochesy and Labrador ³⁶	HeartMapp	Co-management	Internal validation	People with HF [†] Health professionals
Athilingam et al. ³⁷	HeartMapp	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†] Health professionals
Safdari et al.38	NI*	Co-management	Development	Health professionals
Darling et al. ³⁹	Heart Vest Control App	Co-management	Development	People with HF^{\dagger}
Srinivas, Cornet and Holden ⁴⁰	Engage	Self-care	Development	People with HF [†] Family members/ caregivers
Alnosayan et al. ⁴¹	NI*	Co-management	Development and usability	People with HF [†]



Chart	1	- Cont.	
-------	---	---------	--

Authors	Application name	Purpose	Method	Target population
Athilingam et al.42	HeartMapp	Co-management	Development and internal validation	People with HF [†]
Curcio et al.43	e-CRTD	Decision-making	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Madias ⁴⁴	AliveCor	Co-management	Development	People with HF [†]
Chantler et al.45	SUPPORT-HF	Co-management	Usability	People with HF [†]
Radhakrishnan et al.46	Heart Health	Self-management	Development and feasibility	People with HF [†]
Dithmer et al.47	The Heart Game	Cardiac rehabilitation	Development and feasibility	People with HF [†]
Riley et al.48	Care beyond Walls and Wires	Co-management	Development and usability	People with HF [†]
Triantafyllidis et al.49	SUPPORT-HF	Co-management	Development	People with HF^{\dagger}
Goldstein et al. ⁵⁰	NI*	Self-monitoring	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Bartlett et al. ⁵¹	SMART	Self-care	Realistic assessment	People with HF^{\dagger}
Martín et al.52	CardioManager	Co-management	Feasibility	People with HF [†]
Vuorinen et al.53	NI*	Co-management	Clinical validation	People with HF [†]
Suh et al. ⁵⁴	WANDA	Co-management	Development	People with HF [†]
Winkler et al.55	NI*	Co-management	Feasibility	People with HF [†]

*NI: not informed, †: heart failure.

The American continent concentrated the largest number of publications (26; 55.3%), especially the United States $(23; 48.9\%)^{12-13,16,20,22,24,26-27,29,31-33,36-37,39-42,44,46,48,50,54}$, Canada (1; 2.1%)¹⁸ and Argentina (2; 4.3%)¹⁴⁻¹⁵, followed by the European continent, with thirteen (27.7%) studies, three (6.4%) from the United Kingdom^{45,49,51}, Germany (2; 4.3%)^{19,55} and Austria, ²⁸Switzerland²¹, Greece³⁴, Belgium³⁵, Italy⁴³, Denmark⁴⁷, Spain⁵² and Finland⁵³, with one (2.1%) publication each. The Asian continent concentrated five (10.6%) publications from China (1; 2.1%)³⁰, Thailand (1; 2.1%)¹⁰ and Iran (3; 6.4%)^{11,25,38}, and Oceania, three (6.4%), developed by Australia (3; 6.4%)^{9,17,23}.

The studies were published between 2011^{54-55} and 2020^{9-21} . The methods were varied, but clinical validation studies of APPs predominated (15; 31.9%)^{10–11,15–16,18,20,24,26,28,30,35,37,43,50,53}. The 47 published studies brought 39 APPs on HF, among which 20 (51.3%)^{14,16–17,19,2,2,26,29,34–35,38–39,41–42,44–45,48,52–55} had co-management purposes and eight (20.5%)^{9,30,34,38,41,50,53,55} had no names disclosed.

The other information extracted from the studies related to the APPs' target population, theoretical and thematic framework and resources used. It was observed that 19 APPs $(48.7\%)^{14,16,19,21-22,28,30,34,38-39,41-42,44-55,48,52-55}$ had as target population patients and health professionals; 15 $(38.5\%)^{9,11-13,18,20,24,26-27,29,31-32,46,50-51}$ were directed only to patients; two $(5.1\%)^{40,47}$ for patients and their families; one $(2.6\%)^{43}$ for professionals only and one $(2.6\%)^{17}$ for all those involved in the care process: patients and their families and their families.

It was found that 23 $(58.9\%)^{14,16,19-20,22,24,28-30,32,35,38-39,43-44,46,50-55}$ studies did not report the use of a theoretical framework for the development and/or validation of the constructed APPs. Among those who used it, user-centered design (6; 37.5%)^{13,27,31,40,42,47}, followed by codesign (4; 25%), stood out^{9,11-12,17}. The other frameworks were used only by one (6.2%) study each: Continuous Design



Guidelines²¹, Cognitive Social Theory²⁶, Internet of Things³⁴, Scientific Design Research⁴¹, Agile Development Methodology⁴⁵ and Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology¹⁸,

All the studies included collected various information regarding the content (thematic) and features (functionalities) contained in the APP (Figure 2). The themes involved daily care (36; 92.3%)^{9,11–38,40–42,45–55}, well-being (10; 25.6%)^{11–12,21,24,29,34–35,42}. ⁴⁵ and treatments and examinations (7; 17.9%)^{13,21–22,39,41,43–44}. Available features (features) were categorized into: configuration requirements (6; 15.4%)^{11,14,17,34,50,52}, data management (37; 94.9%)^{11–18,20–55}, data transfer (22; 56.4%)^{11–12,14,17,19–22,28,30–34,38–39,41–42,45,50,53–55} and gamification (5; 12.8%)^{9,21,28,46–47}.

We also sought to identify positive and negative aspects of the development and use of selected APPs. In general, they allowed better data management;^{9–10,12,16–18,26–27,31,36–38,41,46,51,54} guided clinical decision-making;^{21–22,36–37,43} allowed personalized care;^{14–15,28,31} assisted in the organization and proper use of medicines;^{9,18,26–27,31} can be used at any time;^{18,54} information could be shared and enabled daily communication with health professionals;^{18–19,28,31,41,53–55} allowed to perform tasks and daily activities proposed more quickly;^{31,38,43,54} and reduced health costs⁵².

However, some limitations were highlighted, such as technical and/or design problems;^{18,31,40–41,51} requirement of technological literacy and understanding of user types;^{9,29,31,36–37,42,47} needs for connectivity and protection of personal information;^{9–11,14–15,20–23,25,28–32,34,37–39,41–42,44–46,49–50,53–55} operating system restriction;^{9,19–29,31} need other devices;^{31,35,39,54–55} and high cost for development, maintenance and use^{28,31}.





DISCUSSION

The growing search for the quality of care through APP for people with HF portrays the relevance of new therapeutic modalities that favor users, family members and professionals, enhancing positive health outcomes with greater flexibility. With the growth of the Internet, it increases the sale of smartphones and, with this, intensifies the development of studies of APP construction, validation, usability, readability, accessibility and adequacy.

In HF, the first published studies on APP were in 2011, from the United States and Germany. Despite the expansion over the years, Americans still focus on most studies. The United States is marked by intense social inequities, evidenced by the geographical variation in mortality rates of the disease^{12–13}. Still, there are many risk factors for the development of HF, such as inadequate lifestyle habits¹⁶. that corroborate the high prevalence of the disease in the country.

It is emphasized that there are no studies from Brazil, despite the high prevalence of the disease in the country. Despite the existence of Brazilian APPs in the main virtual stores (Google play and Apple store), it was not possible to find, in the literature, research that describes the process of construction and validation. This finding is worrisome, because the creation of these technological tools requires adequately defined and structured steps for the APP to be useful to the end user.

The clinical heterogeneity of HF is perceived in several management strategies and care actions implemented. Thinking about the person with HF is valuing the individual, understanding the uniqueness of the other. Thus, care cannot be conceived in a timely manner, but through an enlarged look. In this perspective, the plurality of the purposes, themes (contents) and resources identified in the studies is justified. However, developing a technology for care requires caution. Furthermore, researchers demand a thorough investigation of socioeconomic, behavioral and cognitive aspects of users, in addition to choosing the appropriate method for technological structuring. Different theoretical frameworks that guide the construction of APP emerged, with emphasis on user-centered design (UCD) and codesign.

The UCD method was used to develop APP with the objective of increasing knowledge levels¹³, self-care^{27,40}. self-management³¹ and co-management^{36–37,42}. It establishes collaboration between users and researchers in the design phase^{27,47}. Codesign was employed in APP whose purpose was to increase knowledge and self-care^{9–11}, self-monitoring¹² and co-management^{17,23}. It is the creative and participatory process that involves diverse group of individuals interested in exploring, developing and testing a technology^{9–12,17}.

The two approaches converge on the relevance of the insertion of users in the project, because designers are not always able to understand their health demands. However, the chronicity and complexity of HF are not only associated with biological changes from the disease, but involve individuals' surroundings, where social, economic and demographic determinants influence the prognosis^{12–13,17,19,27,34}, making it vulnerable. Thus, methods with the participation of all those involved in the care process, which consider social, physical and cognitive aspects of their public, are essential for APP development^{33,38–39}, acceptability⁹, adequacy^{29,31} and feasibility^{46–47,52,55}.

As for the purposes, it was found the researchers' concern in stimulating self-care and management of HF. Self-care involves taking actions and adoption of health-maintained behaviors^{11,20,24,26}, while management or management is the active participation of patients in their treatment^{16,21,24,36}. In HF, these purposes are interconnected because self-care is vital to successful management.

In the studies analyzed, patients who used APP for self-care and co-management presented better health results, because they allowed the organization of care and the sharing of information with health professionals^{29,31,36–37}. Thus, they contributed to self-perception of alarm symptoms³³,



participation of patients in professionals' clinical decision-making process^{21,43}, contributing to the elaboration of reliable diagnoses and targeted therapeutic guidelines/approaches^{14–15}.

There was a predominance of studies with patients and professionals, few were developed in order to integrate family members/caregivers. Self-care and disease management practices are more effective when all actively participate in care actions. Therefore, it is relevant that family members make use of these tools to strengthen care and invest in safer care⁴³. When developed for patients, APPs function as facilitating strategies of self-care, maintenance of autonomy and independence. For family members/caregivers who play an important role in the care of patients with HF, APPs are an additional form of information^{17,47}.

Multiple themes were addressed in the studies, mainly related to daily care. However, despite the number of studies, themes such as the functioning of the network system and public policies, economic support, with explanation about the rights, benefits and aid of the government, sexual activity and family planning, breathing exercises, oral hygiene, vaccination, palliative care, hospital discharge, and health vulnerability were neglected. This absence reaffirms the complexity of the disease and highlights relevant gaps in the scientific literature.

HF requires daily reorganization of affected people. Adhering to therapy requires discipline and resilience, in addition to understanding the various situations of vulnerability experienced¹⁰. In this scope, the incorporation of resources is an essential strategy for managing information and thus facilitating care. HF demands innovative actions that allow reinventing the way of caring, in a creative and, several times, playful way, with positive reinforcements. In the studies, resources programmed and invested in the APPs included configuration, management, data transfer, and gamification requirements.

The chronic character of HF requires changes in lifestyle, which can increase patients' quality of life and life expectancy. Continuous monitoring and care of daily vital signs allow them to recognize changes or complications early. However, self-monitoring rates are low, as patients often forget to record relevant information, such as signs and symptoms, vital signs, and medications in use^{21,56}. This complicates check-ups and makes it difficult to identify condition worsening.

This said, APPs that provide resources that offer comfortable use to patients, with interactive elements that provide reliable information, such as data insertion and transmission, can increase patient safety, decrease hospitalization episodes, and share their data with health professionals. APP with risk stratification and diagnostics feature are tools essential to health professionals and patients for providing prognosis and personalized treatment^{22,43}.

Finally, among the resources, strategies such as gamification with the use of avatars and motivational games proved to be effective in personalized health training, knowledge improvement, maintenance and trust for self-care, through daily challenges and scoring systems, in addition to winning medals and rewards^{9–10,47}.

The methods adopted, purposes, themes and resources allowed the availability of APP with numerous positive aspects. However, authors reinforced the need to know the profiles of users, which can affect the way the system is used³¹, which requires care in the use of APPs from other cultures. Moreover, it is important to observe the need for adaptation for people with visual and/or hearing impairment⁹. Dependence on a wireless Internet-type technology system was also a limiting factor for low-power populations^{31–32}. It is also important to note that gamified APPs can generate a sense of defeat by working with punctuation and requiring high digital literacy⁴⁷.

This scoping review has as limitations the inclusion of selected studies in nine databases and health portals, and only those available electronically in full were analyzed, factors that may have limited access to other relevant data.



CONCLUSION

The mapping of mobile applications for care in HF has shown that, despite the globalized technological expansion, the United States still concentrates the majority of studies on the met. Even though there are Brazilian APPs in the main virtual stores (Google play and Apple store), it was not possible to find, in the literature, searches that describe the process of construction and validation of Brazilian applications available in the virtual stores.

This finding is worrisome, as the creation of these technological tools requires properly defined and structured steps for the APP to be useful to the end user. Therefore, different theoretical frameworks that guide the construction of APP emerged with emphasis on UCD and codesign.

Nevertheless, the findings showed a small number of APPs aimed at family members and/or caregivers of people with HF. Even, they pointed out hiatus in several themes that involve individuals and their surroundings, essential for comprehensive care.

It is expected that, from the realities identified and presented throughout this review, new research may emerge and serve as support to raise awareness of the theme. It also aims to assist in the production of technologies based on solid theoretical frameworks to then restructure practices of care for patients with HF.

REFERENCES

- Lippi G, Sanchis-Gomar F. Global epidemiology and future trends of heart failure. AME Med J [Internet]. 2020 Jun [cited 2021 May 12];5(15):1-6. Available from: https://doi.org/10.21037/ amj.2020.03.03
- Dimenstein M, Cirilo Neto M. Conceptual approaches to vulnerability in health and social care. Pesqui Prat Psicossociais [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 May 12];15(1):e2935. Available from: http://pepsic.bvsalud.org/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S1809-89082020000100002&Ing= pt&tIng=pt
- 3. Chaves SE, Ratto CG. Fronteiras da formação em saúde: notas sobre a potência da vulnerabilidade. Interface [Internet]. 2018 Jan-Mar [cited 2021 May 14];22(64):189-98. Available from: https://doi. org/10.1590/1807-57622016.0697
- 4. Carmo ME, Guizardi FL. Desafios da intersetorialidade nas políticas públicas de saúde e assistência social: uma revisão do estado da arte. Physis [Internet]. 2017 Oct-Dec [cited 2021 May 14];27(4):1265-86. Available from: http://doi.org/10.1590/s0103-73312017000400021
- Paula TR, Menezes AP, Guedes NG, Silva VM, Cardoso MVLML, Ramos ES. Effectiveness of mobile applications for behavioral changes in health: a systematic review. Rev Rene [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 Feb 22];21:e43845. Available from: http://doi.org/10.15253/2175-6783.20202143845
- Pezel T, Berthelot E, Gauthier J, Chong-Nguyen C, Iliou MC, Juillière Y, et al. Epidemiological characteristics and therapeutic management of patients with chronic heart failure who use smartphones: potential impact of a dedicated smartphone application (report from the OFICSel study). Arch Cardiol Dis [Internet]. 2020 Jan [cited 2021 May 23];114(1):51-8. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acvd.2020.05.006
- Peters MDJ, Godfrey C, McInerney P, Munn Z, Tricco AC, Khalil H. Chapter 11: Scoping review (2020 version). In: Aromataris E, Munn Z, editors. JBI Manual for Evidence Synthesis. Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 May 12]. Available from: https://doi.org/10.46658/ jbimes-20-12
- 8. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG. Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement. PLoS Med [Internet]. 2009 Jul 21[cited 2021 Apr 24];6(7):e1000097. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1000097



- 9. Du H, Wonggom P, Burdeniuk C, Wight J, Nolan P, Barry T, et al. Development and feasibility testing of na interactive avatar education application for education of patients with heart failure. Brit J Cardiac Nurs [Internet]. 2020 Jun 17 [cited 2021 Feb 12];15(6). Available from: https://doi. org/10.12968/bjca.2020.0007
- Wonggom P, Nolan P, Clark RA, Burdeniuk C, Nesbitt K, O'Toole K, et al. Effectiveness of an avatar educational application for improving heart failure patients' knowledge and self-care behaviors: a pragmatic randomized controlled trial. J Adv Nurs [Internet]. 2020 Sep [cited 2021 Mar 24];76(9):2401-15. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.14414
- 11. Kiyarosta N, Ghezeljeh TN, Naghashzadeh F, Feizi M, Haghani S. The effect of using smartphone applications on self-care in patients with heart failure. Nurs Pract Today [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 May 12];7(4):311-21. Available from: https://doi.org/10.18502/npt.v7i4.4041
- Heiney SP, Donevan SB, Adams AS, Parker PD, Chen H, Levkoft S. A smartphone app for self-management of heart failure in older african americans: feasibility and usability study. JMIR Aging [Internet]. 2020 Apr 3 [cited 2021 May 24];3(1):e17142. Available from: https://doi. org/10.2196/17142
- Cornet VP, Toscos T, Bolchini D, Ghahari RR, Ahmed R, Daley C, et al. Untold stories in usercenterd design of mobile health: practical challenges and strategies learned from the design and evaluation of na app for older adults with heart failure. JMIR Mhealth Uhealth [Internet]. 2020 Jul 21 [cited 2021 May 5];8(7):e17703. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/17703
- Yanicelli LM, Goy CB, González VC, Palacios GN, Martínez EC, Herrera MC. Non-invasive home telemonitoring system for heart failure patients: a randomized clinical trial. J Telemed Telecare [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 Jan 23];27(9):553-61. Available from: https://doi. org/10.1177/1357633X19899261
- 15. Yanicelli LM, Vegetti M, Goy CB, Martínez EC, Herrera MC. SiTe iC: a telemonitoring system for heart failure patients. Int J Med Infom [Internet]. 2020 Sep [cited 2021 May 12];141:104204. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmedinf.2020.104204
- DeVore AD, Granger BB, Fonarow GC, Al-Khalidi HR, Albert NM, Lewis EF, et al. Careoptimization through patient and hospital engagement clinical trial for heart failure: rationale and design of connect-HF. Am Heart J [Internet]. 2020 Feb [cited 2021 Feb 22];220:41-50. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ahj.2019.09.012
- 17. Woods L, Roehrer E, Duff J, Walker K, Cummings E. Co-design of a mobile health app for heart failure: perspectives from the team. Stud Health Technol Inform [Internet]. 2019 Aug 8 [cited 2021 May 12];266:183-8. Available from: https://doi.org/10.3233/SHTI190792
- Ware P, Dorai M, Ross HJ, Cafazzo JA, Laport A, Boodoo C, et al. Patients adherence to a mobile phone-based heart failure telemonitoring program: a longitudinal mixed-methods study. JMIR Mhealth and Uhealth [Internet]. 2019 Feb 26 [cited 2021 May 14];7(2):e13259. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/13259
- 19. Werhahn SM, Dathe H, Rottmann T, Franke T, Vahdat D, Hasenful G, et al. Designing meaningful outcome parameters using mobile technology: a new mobile application for telemonitoring patients with heart failure. ESC Heart Fail [Internet]. 2019 Jun [cited 2021 May 16];6(3):516-25. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1002/ehf2.12425
- Sharma A, Mentz RJ, Granger BB, Heitner JF, Cooper LB, Banerjee D, et al. Utilizing mobile technologies to improve physical activity and medication adherence in patients with heart faiilure and diabetes mellitus: rationale and design of the TARGET-HF-DM trial. Am Heart J [Internet]. 2019 May [cited 2021 May 22];211:22-33. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ahj.2019.01.007
- 21. Arulnathan A, Vaaheesan S, Denecke K. A mobile application for self-monitoring for patients with heart failure. Stud Health Technol Inform [Internet]. 2019 [cited 2021 May 24];259:113-6. Available from: https://doi.org/10.3233/978-1-61499-961-4-113



- 22. Windmon A, Minakshi M, Bharti P, Chellappan S, Johansson M, Jenkins BA, et al. TussisWatch: a smartphone system to identify cough episodes as early symptoms of chronic obstructive 'pulmonary disease and congestive heart failure. IEEE J Biomed Health Inform [Internet]. 2019 Jul [cited 2021 Feb 22];23(4):1566-73. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1109/JBHI.2018.2872038
- 23. Woods LS, Duff J, Roehrer E, Walker K, Cummings E. Patients' experiences of using a consumer mHealth app for self-management of heart failure: mixed-methods study. JMIR Hum Factors [Internet]. 2019 May 2 [cited 2021 May 12];6(2):e13009. Available from: https://doi. org/10.2196/13009
- 24. Baik D, Reading M, Jia H, Grossman LV, Creber RM. Measuring health status and symptom burden using a web-based mHealth application in patients with heart failure. Eur J Cardiovasc Nurs [Internet]. 2019 Apr [cited 2021 Jan 12];18(4):325-31. Available from: https://doi. org/10.1177/1474515119825704
- 25. Kongsofla D, ghezeljeh N, Shahirivar S, Peuravi H, Kiaroosta N. Design and evaluation of a smartphone-based application to manage the treatment of people with heart failure. Iran J War Public Health [Internet]. 2019 [cited 2021 Feb 12];11(3):125-31. Available from: https://doi. org/10.29252/ijwph.11.3.125
- 26. Lloyd T, Buck H, Foy A, Black S, Pinter A, Pogash R, et al. The Penn State Heart Assistant: a pilot study of a web-vased intervention to improve self-care of heart failure patients. Health Informatics J [Internet]. 2019 Jun [cited 2021 Jan 15];25(2):292-303. Available from: https://doi. org/10.1177/1460458217704247
- 27. Zhang L, Babu SV, Jindal M, Williams JE, Gimbel RW. A patientcentered mobile phone app (iHeartU) with a virtual human assistant for self-management of heart failure: protocol for a usability assessment study. JMIR Res Protoc [Internet]. 2019 May 23 [cited 2021 May 12];8(5):e13502. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/13502
- Scherr D, Kastner P, Kollmann A, Hallas A, Auer J, Krappinger H, et al. Effect of home-based telemonitoring using mobile phone technology on the outcome of heart failure patients after an episode of acute descompensation: randomized controller trial. J Med Internet Res [Internet]. 2009 Aug 17 [cited 2021 May 21];11(3):e34. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.1252
- 29. Athilingam P, Jenkins B, Redding BA. Reading level and suitability of congestive heart failure (CHF) education in a mobile app (CHF Info App): descriptive design study. JMIR Aging [Internet]. 2019 Apr 25 [cited 2021 Jan 23];2(1):e12134. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/12134
- Guo X, Gu X, Jiang J, Li H, Duan R, Zhang Y, et al. A hospital-community-family-based telehelth program for patients with chronic heart failure: single-arm, prospective feasibility study. JMIR Mhealth Uhealth [Internet]. 2019 Dec 13 [cited 2021 Jan 23];7(12):e13229. Available from: https:// doi.org/10.2196/13229
- 31. Haynes SC, Kim KK. A mobile system for the improvement of heart failure management: evaluation of a prototipe. AMIA Annu Symp Proc [Internet]. 2018 Apr 16 [cited 2021 Jan 23];2017:839-48. Available from: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5977691/pdf/2728943.pdf
- 32. Portz JD, Vehovec A, Dolansky MA, Levin JB, Bull S, Boxer R. The development and acceptability of a mobile application for tracking symptoms of heart failure among older adults. Telem J E Health [Internet]. 2018 Feb [cited 2021 May 12];24(2):161-5. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1089/ tmj.2017.0036
- Foster M. A mobile application for patients with heart failure: theory- and evidence-based design and testing. Comput Inform Nurs [Internet]. 2018 Nov [cited 2021 May 21];36(11):540-9. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1097/CIN.00000000000465
- 34. Spanakis EG, Psaraki M, Sakkalis V. Congestive heart failure risk assessment monitoring through internet of things and mobile personal health systems. Annu Int Conf IEEE Eng Med Biol Soc



[Internet]. 2018 Jul [cited 2021 Jan 23];2018:2925-8. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1109/ EMBC.2018.8513024

- Baert A, Clays E, Bollinger L, Smedt D, Lustrek M, Vodopija A, et al. A personal decision support system for heart failure management (HeartMan): study protocol of the HeartMand randomized controlled trial. BMC Cardiovasc Disord [Internet]. 2018 Sep 27 [cited 2021 Jan 23];18(1):186. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1186/s12872-018-0921-2
- Athilingam P, Clochesy JM, Labrador MA. Intervention mapping approach in the design of an interactive mobule health application to improve self-care in heart failure. Comput Inform Nurs [Internet]. 2018 Feb [cited 2021 Jan 12];36(2):90-7. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1097/ CIN.00000000000383
- Athilingam P, Labrador MA, Remo EFJ, Mack L, Juan ABS, Elliott AF. Features and usability assessment of a patient-centered mobile application (HeartMapp) for self-management of heart failure). Appl Nurs Res [Internet]. 2016 Nov [cited 2021 Jan 12];32:156-63. Available from: https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.apnr.2016.07.001
- Safdari R, Jafarpour M, Mokhtaran M, Naderi N. Designing and implementarion of a heart failure telemonitoring system. Acta Inform Med [Internet]. 2017 Sep [cited 2021 Feb 12];25(3):156-62. Available from: https://doi.org/10.5455/aim.2017.25.156-162
- Darling CE, Dovancescu S, Saczynski JS, Riistama J, Kuniyoshi FS, Rock J, et al. Bioimpedancebased heart failure deterioration prediction using a prototype fluid accumulation vest-mobile phone dyad: na observational study. JMIR Cardio [Internet]. 2017 Mar 13 [cited 2021 Feb 09];1(1):e1. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/cardio.6057
- 40. Srinivas P, Cornet V, Holden R. Human factors analysis, design, and evaluation of Engage, a consumer health IT application for geriatric heart failure self-care. Int J Hum Comput Interact [Internet]. 2017 [cited 2021 Jan 23];33(4):298-312. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1080/104 47318.2016.1265784
- 41. Alnosayan N, Chatterjee S, Alluhaidan A, Edward L, Feenstra LH. Design and usability of heart failure mHealth system: a pilot study. JMIR Hum Factors [Internet]. 2017 Mar 24 [cited 2021 Jan 21];4(1):e9. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/humanfactors.6481
- 42. Athilingam P, Jenkins B, Johansson M, Labrador M. A mobile health intervention to improve selfcare in patients with heart failure: pilot randomized control trial. JMIR Cardio [Internet]. 2017 Aug 11 [cited 2021 Jan 26];1(2):e3. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/cardio.7848
- Curcio A, Rosa S, Sabatino J, Luca S, Bochicchio A, Polimeni A, et al. Clinical usefulness of a mobile application for the appropriated selection of the antiarrhythmic device in heart failure. Pacing Clin Electrophysiol [Internet]. 2016 Jul [cited 2021 Jan 25];39(7):696-702. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/pace.12872
- 44. Madias JE. A proposal for monitoring patients with heart failure via "smart phone technology" -based electrocardiograms. J Electrocardiol [Internet]. 2016 Sep-Oct [cited 2021 Jan 23];49(5):699-706. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jelectrocard.2016.06.001
- 45. Chantler T, Paton C, Velardo C, Triantafyllidis A, Shah SA, Stoppani E, et al. Creating connections - the development of a mobile-health monitoring system for heart failure: qualitative findings from a usability cohort study. Digit Health [Internet]. 2016 Oct 10 [cited 2021 Jan 22];2:2055207616671461. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/2055207616671461
- 46. Radhakrishnan K, Toprac P, O'Hair M, Bias R, Kim MT, Bradley P, et al. Interactive digital e-Health Game for heart failure self-management: a feasibility study. Games Health J [Internet]. 2016 Dec [cited 2021 Jan 12];5(6):366-74. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1089/g4h.2016.0038
- 47. Dithmer M, Rasmussen JO, Grönvall E, Spindler H, Hansen J, Nielsen G, et al. "The Heart Game": using gamification as part of a telerehabilitation program for heart patients. Games Health



J [Internet]. 2016 Feb [cited 2021 Feb 12];5(1):27-33. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1089/ g4h.2015.0001

- Riley WT, Keberlein P, Sorenson G, Mohler S, Tye B, Ramizes AS, et al. Program evaluation of remote heart failure monitoring: healthcare utilization analysis in a rural regional medical center. Telemedicine J E Health [Internet]. 2015 Mar [cited 2021 Jan 23];21(3):157-62. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1089/tmj.2014.0093
- Triantafyllidis A, Velardo C, Chantler T, Shah SA, Paton C, Khorshidi R, et al. A personalised mobile-based home monitoring system for heart failure: the SUPPORT-HF study. Int J Med Inform [Internet]. 2015 [cited 2021 Jan 25]; 84(10):743-5. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. ijmedinf.2015.05.003
- 50. Goldstein CM, Gathright EC, Dolansky MA, Gunstad J, Sterns A, Redle JD, et al. Randomized controlled feasibility trial of two telemedicine medication reminder systems for older adults with heart failure. J Telemed Telec [Internet]. 2014 Sep [cited 2021 Jan 23];20(6):293-9. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/1357633X14541039
- 51. Bartlett YK, Haywood A, Bentley CL, Parker J, Hawley MS, Mountain GA, et al. The SMART personalised self-management system for congestive heart failure: results of a realist evaluation. BMC Med Inform Decis Mak [Internet]. 2014 Nov 25 [cited 2021 Feb 12];14(109). Available from: https://doi.org/10.1186/s12911-014-0109-3
- 52. Martín JAC, Martínez-Pérez B, Torre-Diez I, López-Coronado M. Economic impact assessment from the use of a mobile app for the self-management of heart diseases by ptients with heart failure in a Spanish region. J Med Syst [Internet]. 2014 Sep [cited 2021 Jan 16];38(9):96. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1007/s10916-014-0096-z
- Vuorinen AL, Leppänen J, Kaijanranta H, Kulju M, Helio T, Gils M, et al. Use of home telemonitoring to support multidisciplinary care of heart failure patients in Finland: randomized controlled trial. J Med Internet Res [Internet]. 2014 Dec 11 [cited 2021 Feb 16];16(12):e282. Available from: https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.3651
- 54. Suh M, Chen C, Woodbridge J, Tu MK, Kim JI, Nahapetian A, et al. A remote patient monitoring system for congestive heart failure. J Med Syst [Internet]. 2011 Oct [cited 2021 Jan 23];35(5):1165-79. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1007/s10916-011-9733-y
- 55. Winkler S, Schieber M, Lücke S, Heinze P, Schweizer T, Wegertseder D, et al. A new telemonitoring system intended for chronic heart failure patients using mobile telephone technology - feasibility study. Int J Cardiol [Internet]. 2011 Nov 17 [cited 2021 Jan 27];153(1):55-8. Available from: https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.ijcard.2010.08.038
- 56. Gonçali SS, Grotti EMO, Furuia RK, Dantas RAS, Rossi LA, Dessotte CAM. Health-related quality of life of patients with permanent cardiac pacing. Texto Contexto Enferm [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 Jun 9];29:e20180486. Available from: http://doi.org/10.1590/1980-265X-TCE-2018-0486



NOTES

CONTRIBUTION OF AUTHORITY

Study design: Cestari VRF, Florêncio RS and Pessoa VLMP. Data collection: Cestari VRF and Souza LC. Data analysis and interpretation: Cestari VRF, Souza LC, Garces TS and Florêncio RS. Discussion of results: Cestari VRF. Writing and/or critical review of content: Cestari VRF, Souza LC, Garces TS, Florêncio RS, Pessoa VLMP and Moreira TMM.

Review and final approval of the final version: Cestari VRF, Souza LC, Garces TS, Florêncio RS, Pessoa VLMP e Moreira TMM.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

There is no conflict of interest.

EDITORS

Associated Editors: Gisele Cristina Manfrini, Monica Motta Lino. Editor-in-chief: Roberta Costa.

HISTORICAL

Received: June 10, 2021. Approved: October 19, 2021.

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR

Thiago Santos Garces thiagogarces0812@hotmail.com

